

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Staff Recommendation

ic Industry (SIC 4911)					
/:					Reference
Risk Adjusted Models					
	CAPM			10.31%	Page 5
Dividend Growth Models	DGM or DCF Mc	odel (Dividend Growth)	9.50%	Page 7
		odel (Earnings Growth)		9.50%	Page 7
		odel (b * ROE = Grow		7.50%	Page 7
	Multi Stage DCF	`	,	8.00%	Page 8
	Average			8.96%	
				0.700/	
Estimated Cost of Equity Capital Estimated Cost of Debt Capital				9.70% 5.77%	Page 3
	Cost of Capital	Summary			Page 3
	Cost of Capital	Summary	Before-Tax Weighted		Page 3
	-	Summary Cost of Capital			Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital	Market Capital	·	Weighted Average		Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital		Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component Debt	Market Capital Structure 45.00%	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital		Page 3



Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Staff Recommendation

Electric Indus	try (SIC 4911)					
		Direc	t Rate			Reference
Equity:						
Estir	mated Cost of Equity Capital				5.10%	Page 9
Debt:						
Estir	mated Cost of Debt Capital				3.45%	Page 10
		Cost of Capi	tal Summary			
_Capi	ital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital		
Deb	t	45.00%	3.45%	1.55%		
Equi	ity	55.00%	5.10%	2.81%		
Tota	al	100.00%	_	4.36%		
			Rounded	4.50%		

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Analysis of Debt Capital

			Rati	ngs
Company	Ticker		Moody's	S&P
Alliant Energy Corporation	LNT		Baa2	A-
Ameren Corporation	AEE		Baa1	BBB+
American Electric Power Company, Inc.	AEP		Baa2	BBB+
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	CNP		Baa2	BBB+
CMS Energy Corporation	CMS		Baa2	BBB+
Entergy Corporation	ETR		Baa2	BBB+
Evergy, Inc.	EVRG		Baa2	BBB+
Fortis, Inc.	FTS.TO		Baa3	A-
MGE Energy, Inc.	MGEE		NR	NR
OGE Energy Corporation	OGE		Baa1	BBB+
Otter Tail Corporation	OTTR		Baa2	BBB
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	WEC		Baa1	A-
	Average R	Rating	Baa2	BBB+
NR = Not Rated				
RW = Rating Withdrawn				
Mergent Bond Record, January 2025				
Corporate	Aaa	Aa	A	Baa
October	4.95%	5.17%	5.33%	5.63%
November	5.14%	5.33%	5.49%	5.78%
December	5.20%	5.37%	5.53%	5.80%
Average	5.10%	5.29%	5.45%	5.74%
	• •		-	
Public Utilities	Aaa	Aa	A	Baa
October	-	5.29%	5.41%	5.61%
November	-	5.43%	5.55%	5.75%
November December	-	5.43% 5.45%	5.55% 5.58%	5.75% 5.77%
December	-			
December	-	5.45%	5.58%	5.77%
- 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1	- - - -	5.45%	5.58%	5.77%
December Average	-	5.45% 5.39% Aa	5.58% 5.51%	5.77% 5.71%
December Average Industrials	- - Aaa	5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05%	5.58% 5.51% A	5.77% 5.71%
December Average Industrials October	- - Aaa 4.95%	5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23%	5.58% 5.51% A 5.24%	5.77% 5.71% Baa 5.65% 5.80%
December Average Industrials October November December	- - Aaa 4.95% 5.14%	5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23%	5.58% 5.51% A 5.24% 5.43%	5.77% 5.71% Baa 5.65%
December Average Industrials October November	- Aaa 4.95% 5.14% 5.20%	5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23% 5.28%	5.58% 5.51% A 5.24% 5.43% 5.47%	5.77% 5.71% Baa 5.65% 5.80% 5.83%
December Average Industrials October November December	- Aaa 4.95% 5.14% 5.20%	5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23% 5.28%	5.58% 5.51% A 5.24% 5.43% 5.47%	5.77% 5.71% Baa 5.65% 5.80% 5.83%

		D - 4'		
		Ratings		
	Disp	ersions & Ave	rages	
Agency	i	# of Companie	es	
S&P				
AAA	1			
AA	2			
A	3	3	9	
BBB	4	9	36	
BB	5			
В	6			
CCC	7			
C	9			
D	10			
Total		12	45	
Average Ra	ting:			3.75
Agency		# of Companie	s	
Moody's				
Aaa	1			
Aa	2			
A	3			
Baa	4	12	48	
Ba	5			
В	6			
Caa	7			
Ca	8			
С	9			
Total		12	48	
Average Ra	ting:			4.00

January 1, 2025

Analysis of the Market Capital Structure

		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Ticker	Debt	Debt	Stock	Shares (mil)	Equity	Equity	Total Capital
Company Name	Symbol	(\$ mil)	%	Price	Outstanding	(\$ mil)	%	(\$ mil)
Alliant Energy Corporation	LNT	10,406	40.27%	60.13	256.69	15,435	59.73%	25,841
Ameren Corporation	AEE	17,262	41.47%	90.26	269.91	24,362	58.53%	41,624
American Electric Power Company, Inc.	AEP	41,832	45.59%	93.68	532.91	49,923	54.41%	91,755
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	CNP	20,461	49.59%	31.92	651.73	20,803	50.41%	41,264
CMS Energy Corporation	CMS	16,501	45.17%	67.04	298.79	20,031	54.83%	36,532
Entergy Corporation	ETR	28,918	47.18%	75.21	430.41	32,371	52.82%	61,289
Evergy, Inc.	EVRG	11,976	45.64%	62.02	229.98	14,263	54.36%	26,239
Fortis, Inc.	FTS.TO	33,214	61.08%	42.55	497.30	21,160	38.92%	54,374
MGE Energy, Inc.	MGEE	721	16.93%	97.68	36.21	3,537	83.07%	4,258
OGE Energy Corporation	OGE	5,053	37.57%	41.75	201.15	8,398	62.43%	13,451
Otter Tail Corporation	OTTR	944	22.74%	76.70	41.83	3,208	77.26%	4,152
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	WEC	20,024	39.76%	95.48	317.75	30,339	60.24%	50,363
Mean:		17,276	41.08%			20,319	58.92%	37,595
Median:		16,882	43.32%			20,417	56.68%	38,898
Market Capital Structure Estimate:		Debt:	45.00%			Equity:	55.00%	

Data Source:

Columns (1) & (4), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 03-07-2025

Column (2) = Column (1) / Column (7)

Column (3), NASDAQ, 12-31-2024 - 30-Day Average

Column (5) = Column (3) * Column (4)

Column (6) = Column (5) / Column (7)

Column (7) = Column (1) + Column (5)

January 1, 2025

Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM)

CAPM ==> $K_e = R_f + (\beta * ERP)$

Electric Industry (SIC 4911)	
Risk-Free Rate (R _f)	4.58%
Beta (β)	0.93
Equity Risk Premium (ERP): (R _m - R _f)*	6.16%
Adjusted Equity Risk Premium: (β * ERP)	5.73%
Cost of Equity Capital - CAPM	10.31%
U.S. Department of the Treasury, Daily Treasury Yield Curve Rates, Selected Yields	
U.S. Treasury Securities:	
2024 December - 30 Day	4.58%
2024 November - 60 Day	4.56%
2024 October - 90 Day	4.49%
Risk-Free Rate of Return R _f , 30-year Treasury Rate. 2024 December - 30 Day Average.	4.58%
* Equity Risk Premium = Average of 7.31% (historical) and 5.00% (Kroll's Recommended)	

January 1, 2025 Beta (β) Analysis

Electric Industry (SIC 4911)		
	Ticker	Beta
Company Name	Symbol	"β"
ALLETE, Inc.	ALE	NA
Alliant Energy Corporation	LNT	0.95
Ameren Corporation	AEE	0.90
American Electric Power Company, Inc.	AEP	0.85
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	CNP	1.10
CMS Energy Corporation	CMS	0.90
Entergy Corporation	ETR	1.00
Evergy, Inc.	EVRG	0.95
Fortis, Inc.	FTS.TO	0.75
MGE Energy, Inc.	MGEE	0.80
OGE Energy Corporation	OGE	1.05
Otter Tail Corporation	OTTR	0.95
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	WEC	0.90
	Mean:	0.93
	Median:	0.93
	Beta (β) Estimate:	0.93
Data Source: Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 03-07-2025		

January 1, 2025

Dividend Growth Model (DGM or DCF)

Electric Industry (SIC 4911)												
		(1)	(2)		(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)				
		Stock	Expected	Dividend	Dividend	Earnings						
	Ticker	Price	Dividend	Yield	Growth	Growth				(Dividends)	(Earnings)	g=(b * ROE)
Company Name	Symbol	P ₀	D_1	(D_1/P_0)	g	g	b	ROE	g=(b * ROE)	K _e	K _e	K _e
ALLETE, Inc.	ALE	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Alliant Energy Corporation	LNT	60.13	2.04	3.39%	6.00%	6.00%	29.00%	9.90%	2.87%	9.39%	9.39%	6.26%
Ameren Corporation	AEE	90.26	2.85	3.16%	6.50%	6.50%	44.00%	11.00%	4.84%	9.66%	9.66%	8.00%
American Electric Power Company, Inc.	AEP	93.68	3.80	4.06%	5.50%	6.50%	37.00%	11.00%	4.07%	9.56%	10.56%	8.13%
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	CNP	31.92	0.89	2.79%	6.00%	6.50%	51.00%	10.00%	5.10%	8.79%	9.29%	7.89%
CMS Energy Corporation	CMS	67.04	2.20	3.28%	5.00%	6.00%	38.00%	12.40%	4.71%	8.28%	9.28%	7.99%
Entergy Corporation	ETR	75.21	2.43	3.23%	5.50%	3.00%	5.00%	6.90%	0.35%	8.73%	6.23%	3.58%
Evergy, Inc.	EVRG	62.02	2.71	4.37%	7.00%	7.50%	32.00%	9.00%	2.88%	11.37%	11.87%	7.25%
Fortis, Inc.	FTS.TO	42.55	2.49	5.85%	6.00%	5.00%	18.00%	7.20%	1.30%	11.85%	10.85%	7.15%
MGE Energy, Inc.	MGEE	97.68	1.95	2.00%	6.50%	7.00%	49.00%	10.50%	5.15%	8.50%	9.00%	7.15%
OGE Energy Corporation	OGE	41.75	1.71	4.10%	3.00%	6.50%	25.00%	12.30%	3.08%	7.10%	10.60%	7.18%
Otter Tail Corporation	OTTR	76.70	2.10	2.74%	7.00%	4.50%	48.00%	18.80%	9.02%	9.74%	7.24%	11.76%
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	WEC	95.48	3.57	3.74%	7.00%	6.00%	32.00%	12.30%	3.94%	10.74%	9.74%	7.68%
	•		Mean:	3.56%	5.92%	5.92%	34.00%	10.94%	3.94%	9.48%	9.48%	7.50%
	•		Median:	3.34%	6.00%	6.25%	34.50%	10.75%	4.01%	9.48%	9.53%	7.47%
								Cost of Equity Capital -	DCF K _e Estimate:	9.50%	9.50%	7.50%

b = (1 - payout ratio) = Retention Ratio

ROE = Return on Book Equity

Data Source:

Column (1), NASDAQ, 12-31-2024, 30-day average

Columns (2) - (6), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 03-07-2025

January 1, 2025

Multiple-Stage Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) Estimated Costs of Common Equity

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
	Expected							Growth	
	Annualized	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	in	Cost
	Quarterly	Years	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Perpetuity	of Equity
Company Name	Dividend	1-5	6	7	8	9	10		
Alliant Energy Corporation	\$2.04	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	7.85%
Ameren Corporation	\$2.85	6.50%	6.05%	5.60%	5.15%	4.70%	4.25%	3.80%	7.69%
American Electric Power Comp	\$3.80	5.50%	5.22%	4.94%	4.66%	4.38%	4.10%	3.80%	8.48%
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	\$0.89	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	7.13%
CMS Energy Corporation	\$2.20	5.00%	4.80%	4.60%	4.40%	4.20%	4.00%	3.80%	7.47%
Entergy Corporation	\$2.43	5.50%	5.22%	4.94%	4.66%	4.38%	4.10%	3.80%	7.54%
Evergy, Inc.	\$2.71	7.00%	6.47%	5.94%	5.41%	4.88%	4.35%	3.80%	9.31%
Fortis, Inc.	\$2.49	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	10.71%
MGE Energy, Inc.	\$1.95	6.50%	6.05%	5.60%	5.15%	4.70%	4.25%	3.80%	6.26%
OGE Energy Corporation	\$1.71	3.00%	3.13%	3.26%	3.39%	3.52%	3.65%	3.80%	7.84%
Otter Tail Corporation	\$2.10	7.00%	6.47%	5.94%	5.41%	4.88%	4.35%	3.80%	7.29%
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	\$3.57	7.00%	6.47%	5.94%	5.41%	4.88%	4.35%	3.80%	8.53%
								Average:	8.01%
								Median:	7.77%
					Cost o	f Fauity Car	oital - DCF I	Ke Estimate:	8.00%

Data Source:

Column (1) = Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 03-07-2025

Column (2) = Value Line average estimated growth rates.

Columns (3) - (7) = Linear reduction of short-term growth rate projections to sustainable level.

Column (8) = Long Term Projected GDP Growth Rate Projections from U.S. Federal Reserve.

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Support for Market Multiples

Electric Industry (SIC 4911)				
		(1)	(2)	
	Ticker	Stock		P/E
Company Name	Symbol	Price	Earnings	Multiple
ALLETE, Inc.	ALE	NA	NA	NA
Alliant Energy Corporation	LNT	60.13	2.69	22.35
Ameren Corporation	AEE	90.26	4.59	19.66
American Electric Power Company, Inc.	AEP	93.68	5.61	16.70
CenterPoint Energy, Inc.	CNP	31.92	1.58	20.20
CMS Energy Corporation	CMS	67.04	3.33	20.13
Entergy Corporation	ETR	75.21	2.45	30.70
Evergy, Inc.	EVRG	62.02	3.80	16.32
Fortis, Inc.	FTS.TO	42.55	3.28	12.97
MGE Energy, Inc.	MGEE	97.68	3.45	28.31
OGE Energy Corporation	OGE	41.75	2.19	19.06
Otter Tail Corporation	OTTR	76.70	7.17	10.70
WEC Energy Group, Inc.	WEC	95.48	4.89	19.53
			Mean	19.72
			Median	19.60
		Р	/E Estimate	19.60
			Equity Rate	5.10%
Data Source:				
Column (1) NASDAQ, 12-31-2024 NASDAQ, 30-day a	_			
Coulmn (2) Value Line Industry Summay & Index, 03-	-07-2025			

January 1, 2025 Direct Debt Rate Calculation

Electric Industry (SIC 4911)	
Direct Capitalization Debt Rate	
Interest Expense (\$ mil)	6,743
Total Value of LT Debt (TVLTD) (\$ mil)	195,286
Current Yield = Interest Expense/TVLTD	3.45%
Data Source:	
Value Line Investment Survey, 03-07-2025	



January 1, 2025

tural Gas Pipeline I						Reference
						Keterenc
Risk Adjusted	d Models					Page 5
		CAPM			11.97%	
Dividend Gro	owth Models					Page 7
			el (Dividend Growth)		11.30%	Page 7
			el (Earnings Growth)		9.11%	Page 7
			el (b * ROE = Growth)		11.20%	Page 8
		Multi Stage DCF			9.70%	
		Average			10.66%	
Estimated Co	ost of Equity Capital				13.71%	
Estimated Co	st of Equity Capital				13.71%	Page 3
	ost of Equity Capital				5.66%	Page 3
		Cost of Capital S	ummary			Page 3
	ost of Debt Capital	Cost of Capital S Market Capital Structure	ummary Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital		Page 3
Estimated Co	ost of Debt Capital	Market Capital		Weighted Average		Page 3
Estimated Co	ost of Debt Capital	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital		Page 3
Estimated Congression Capital Comp	ost of Debt Capital	Market Capital Structure 30.00%	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital		Page 3



						Referenc
		Di	ect Rate			
quity:						
	Estimated Cost of Equity Capital				6.67%	Page 9
ebt:						
	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital				10.03%	Page 10
		Cost of Cap	oital Summar	У		
		Market Capital		Before-Tax Weighted Average		
	Capital Component	Structure	Cost of Capital	Cost of Capital		
	Debt	30.00%	10.03%	3.01%		
	Equity	70.00%	6.67%	4.67%		
				7.68%		
	Total	100.00%	=	710070		
	Total	100.00%	 Rounded	8.00%		

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Analysis of Debt Capital

				Rati	ngs
Company		Ticker		Moody's	S&P
Cheniere Energy PTRS		CQP		Baa3	BBB
Chevron Corp.		CVX		Aa2	AA-
Devon Energy		DVN		Baa2	BBB
Enbridge, Inc.		ENB.TO		Baa2	BBB+
Enterprise Products		EPD		A3	A-
EOG Resources		EOG		A3	A-
Exxon Mobil Corp.		XOM		Aa2	AA-
Hess Corp.		HES		Baa3	BBB-
Hess Midstream		HESM		Ba1	BB+
Kinder Morgan, Inc.		KMI		Baa2	BBB
Marathon Petroleum		MPC		Baa2	BBB
National Fuel Gas		NFG		Baa3	BBB-
Oneok, Inc		OKE		Baa2	BBB
Ovintiv		OVV		Baa3	BBB-
Phillips 66		PSX		A3	BBB+
Valero Energy		VLO		Baa2	BBB
Western Midstream		WES		Baa3	BBB-
Williams Co, Inc.		WMB		Baa2	BBB
		Average	Rating	Baa	BBB
Mergent Bond Record, Januar	y 2025				
Corporate	y 2025	Aaa	Aa	А	Ваа
Corporate October	y 2025	4.95%	5.17%	5.33%	5.639
Corporate October November	y 2025	4.95% 5.14%	5.17% 5.33%	5.33% 5.49%	5.639
Corporate October	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53%	5.639 5.789 5.809
Corporate October November December	y 2025	4.95% 5.14%	5.17% 5.33%	5.33% 5.49%	5.639 5.789 5.809
Corporate October November December Average	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53%	5.639 5.789 5.809
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.749
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.74 9 Baa 5.619
Corporate October November	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.74 9 Baa 5.619 5.759
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.74 9
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.39%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58%	5.633 5.789 5.809 5.749 Baa 5.619 5.759 5.779 5.719
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51%	5.633 5.789 5.809 5.749 Baa 5.619 5.759 5.779 5.719
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa - - - - - - -	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.45% 5.39%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.749 Baa 5.619 5.759 5.779 5.719
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average Industrials October November	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa Aaa 4.95% 5.14%	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51%	5.63: 5.78: 5.80: 5.74: Baa 5.61: 5.75: 5.77: 5.71: Ba 5.65: 5.80:
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average Industrials October November December December December December December	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23% 5.28%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.749 Baa 5.619 5.759 5.779
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average Industrials October November	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51% A 5.24% 5.43% 5.47%	5.63: 5.78: 5.80: 5.74: Baa 5.61: 5.77: 5.77: 5.71: Baa 5.65: 5.80: 5.80: 5.80:
Corporate October November December Average Public Utilities October November December Average Industrials October November October November December Average	y 2025	4.95% 5.14% 5.20% 5.10% Aaa	5.17% 5.33% 5.37% 5.29% Aa 5.29% 5.43% 5.45% 5.39% Aa 5.05% 5.23% 5.28%	5.33% 5.49% 5.53% 5.45% A 5.41% 5.55% 5.58% 5.51% A 5.24% 5.43% 5.47%	5.639 5.789 5.809 5.749 Baa 5.619 5.759 5.779 5.719 Ba 5.659 5.809 5.839

Mergent Bond Record, January 2025

		Ratings		
	Disp	ersions & Ave	rages	
		# of		
Agency		Companies		
S&P				
AAA	1			
AA	2	1	2	
A	3	2	6	
BBB	4	12	48	
BB	5	1	5	
В	6			
CCC	7			
С	9			
D	10			
Total		16	61	
Average Rat	ing:			3.81
Agency		# of Companies		
Moody's				
Aaa	1			
Aa	2	1	2	
A	3	3	9	
		- 11	44	
Baa	4	11		
	5	11	5	
Baa Ba B				
Ba B	5 6			
Ba B Caa	5 6 7			
Ba B Caa Ca	5 6			
Ва	5 6 7 8			

^{1 -} Public Utilites Debt Cost lies between 'A' (5.51%) and 'Baa' (5.71%) Ratings - 3.75 Assigned Value. Average of the two yields is the appropriate Debt Cost Estimate.

January 1, 2025

Analysis of the Market Capital Structure

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline Industrie	s (SIC 4612,	/4922)						
		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Stock	Debt	Debt	Stock	Shares (mil)	Equity	Equity	Total Capital
Company Name	Symbol	(\$ mil)	%	Price	Outstanding	(\$ mil)	%	(\$ mil)
Cheniere Energy PTRS	CQP	15,525	36.67%	55.40	484.05	26,816	63.33%	42,341
Chevron Corp.	CVX	NA	NA	149.94	NA	NA	NA	NA
Devon Energy	DVN	8,884	28.93%	33.22	656.90	21,822	71.07%	30,706
Enbridge, Inc.	ENB.TO	95,300	50.92%	42.17	2,177.96	91,845	49.08%	187,145
Enterprise Products	EPD	29,498	29.98%	31.78	2,167.57	68,885	70.02%	98,383
EOG Resources	EOG	3,776	5.25%	121.07	562.50	68,102	94.75%	71,878
Exxon Mobil Corp.	XOM	42,550	8.12%	109.57	4,395.00	481,560	91.88%	524,110
Hess Corp.	HES	NA	NA	136.32	NA	NA	NA	NA
Hess Midstream	HESM	3,490	47.82%	36.58	104.10	3,808	52.18%	7,298
Kinder Morgan, Inc.	KMI	32,000	34.70%	27.10	2,221.64	60,206	65.30%	92,206
Marathon Petroleum	MPC	28,220	38.16%	142.29	321.39	45,731	61.84%	73,951
National Fuel Gas	NFG	2,687	32.55%	60.93	91.36	5,567	67.45%	8,254
Oneok, Inc	OKE	28,137	31.80%	103.28	584.18	60,334	68.20%	88,471
Ovintiv	OVV	5,877	35.84%	40.41	260.32	10,520	64.16%	16,397
Phillips 66	PSX	19,998	15.71%	119.20	900.00	107,280	84.29%	127,278
Valero Energy	VLO	10,806	21.31%	126.02	316.59	39,897	78.69%	50,703
Western Midstream	WES	7,937	34.69%	39.26	380.56	14,941	65.31%	22,878
Williams Co, Inc.	WMB	2,711	3.91%	54.65	1,219.01	66,619	96.09%	69,330
Mean:		21,087	28.52%			73,371	71.48%	94,458
Median:		13,166	32.18%			52,969	67.83%	70,604
Market Capital Structure Estimate:		Debt:	30.00%			Equity:	70.00%	

Data Source:

Columns (1) & (4), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 11-22-2024

Column (2) = Column (1) / Column (7)

Column (3), NASDAQ, 12-31-2024

Column (5) = Column (3) * Column (4)

Column (7) = Column (1) + Column (5)

January 1, 2025 Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM)

CAPM ==> $K_e = R_f + \beta$ (ERP)

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline Industries (SIC 4612/4922)	
Risk-Free Rate	4.58%
Beta (β)	1.20
Equity Risk Premium (ERP): (R _m - R _f)*	6.16%
Adjusted Equity Risk Premium: (β * ERP)	7.39%
Cost of Equity Capital - CAPM	11.97%
U.S. Department of the Treasury, Daily Treasury Yield Curve Rates, Selected Yields U.S. Treasury Securities:	
U.S. Treasury Securities:	
2024 December - 30 Day	4.58%
2024 November - 60 Day	4.56%
2024 October - 90 Day	4.49%
Risk-Free Rate of Return R _f , 30-year Treasury Rate. 2024 December - 30 Day Average.	4.58%
* Equity Risk Premium = Average of 7.31% (historical) and 5.0% (Kroll's Recommended)	

January 1, 2025 Beta (β) Analysis

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline Indu	ustries (SIC	4612/4922)
Company Name	Stock Symbol		Beta "β"
Cheniere Energy PTRS	CQP		0.95
Devon Energy	DVN		1.45
Enbridge, Inc.	ENB.TO		0.85
Enterprise Products	EPD		1.00
EOG Resources	EOG		1.15
Exxon Mobil Corp.	XOM		1.05
Hess Midstream	HESM		1.05
Kinder Morgan, Inc.	KMI		1.15
Marathon Petroleum	MPC		1.50
National Fuel Gas	NFG		0.85
Oneok, Inc	OKE		1.50
Ovintiv	OVV		1.55
Phillips 66	PSX		1.25
Valero Energy	VLO		1.40
Western Midstream	WES		1.35
Williams Co, Inc.	WMB		1.10
		Mean:	1.20
		Median:	1.15
	Beta (β)	Estimate:	1.20
<u>Data Source:</u> Value Line Industry Summary & Index,	11-22-2024		

January 1, 2025

Dividend Growth Model (DGM or DCF)

	D_1	where	
DGM or DCF Model ==> K_e =	+ g	K _e =	Cost of Equity
	P_0	D ₁ =	Expected Dividends
		P ₀ =	Current Price
		g =	Sustainable Growth

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline In	ndustries (SIC 46	12/4922)					_						
		(1)	(2)		(3)	(4)	П	(5)	(6)				
	Stock	Stock Price	Expected Dividend	Dividend Yield	Dividend Growth	Earnings Growth	П				(Dividends)	(Earnings)	g=(b * ROE)
Company Name	Symbol	P ₀	D_1	(D_1/P_0)	g	g	П	b	ROE	g=(b * ROE)	K _e	K _e	K _e
Cheniere Energy PTRS	CQP	55.40	3.28	5.92%	4.00%	1.50%	П	43.00%	NMF	NMF	9.92%	7.42%	NMF
Devon Energy	DVN	33.22	0.96	2.89%	9.50%	3.50%	П	82.00%	21.50%	17.63%	12.39%	6.39%	20.52%
Enbridge, Inc.	ENB.TO	42.17	3.80	9.01%	2.50%	5.00%		NMF	9.00%	NMF	11.51%	14.01%	NMF
Enterprise Products	EPD	31.78	2.20	6.92%	10.00%	6.00%	Ш	22.00%	20.00%	4.40%	16.92%	12.92%	11.32%
EOG Resources	EOG	121.07	4.00	3.30%	11.00%	7.00%	Ш	69.00%	22.50%	15.53%	14.30%	10.30%	18.83%
Exxon Mobil Corp.	XOM	109.57	4.00	3.65%	3.00%	-3.00%	Ш	52.00%	13.00%	6.76%	6.65%	0.65%	10.41%
Hess Midstream	HESM	36.58	3.05	8.34%	9.00%	11.00%	Ш	-8.00%	48.50%	-3.88%	17.34%	19.34%	4.46%
Kinder Morgan, Inc.	KMI	27.10	1.20	4.43%	6.00%	10.00%		0.00%	7.50%	0.00%	10.43%	14.43%	4.43%
Marathon Petroleum	MPC	142.29	3.70	2.60%	6.00%	-6.00%	Ш	68.00%	16.00%	10.88%	8.60%	-3.40%	13.48%
National Fuel Gas	NFG	60.93	2.04	3.35%	3.00%	4.00%	Ш	60.00%	16.20%	9.72%	6.35%	7.35%	13.07%
Oneok, Inc	OKE	103.28	4.10	3.97%	4.00%	12.00%	Ш	21.00%	17.00%	3.57%	7.97%	15.97%	7.54%
Ovintiv	OVV	40.41	1.32	3.27%	10.00%	5.50%	Ш	80.00%	14.50%	11.60%	13.27%	8.77%	14.87%
Phillips 66	PSX	119.20	4.70	3.94%	6.00%	0.50%	Ш	27.00%	8.50%	2.30%	9.94%	4.44%	6.24%
Valero Energy	VLO	126.02	4.26	3.38%	2.00%	-6.00%	Ш	50.00%	10.50%	5.25%	5.38%	-2.62%	8.63%
Western Midstream	WES	39.26	3.55	9.04%	12.50%	7.00%		20.00%	46.00%	9.20%	21.54%	16.04%	18.24%
Williams Co, Inc.	WMB	54.65	2.02	3.70%	4.50%	10.00%	Ц	5.00%	21.00%	1.05%	8.20%	13.70%	4.75%
			Mean:	4.86%	6.44%	4.25%		39.40%	19.45%	6.72%	11.29%	9.11%	11.20%
			Median:	3.82%	6.00%	5.25%		43.00%	16.20%	6.01%	10.19%	9.54%	10.87%
								Cost of Equ	ity Capital -	DCF K _e Estimate:	11.30%	9.11%	11.20%

Notes:

b = (1 - payout ratio) = Retention Ratio

ROE = Return on Book Equity

Not Meaningful (NMF)

Data Source:

Column (1), NASDAQ, 12-31-2024, 30-day average

Columns (2) - (6), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 11-22-2024

January 1, 2025

Multiple-Stage Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) Estimated Costs of Common Equity

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
	Expected								
	Annualized	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Growth	Cost
	Quarterly	Years	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	in Perpetuity	of Equity
Company Name	Dividend	1-5	6	7	8	9	10		
Cheniere Energy PTRS	3.28	4.00%	3.97%	3.94%	3.91%	3.88%	3.85%	3.80%	10.02%
Devon Energy	0.96	9.50%	8.55%	7.60%	6.65%	5.70%	#VALUE!	3.80%	NA
Enbridge, Inc.	3.80	2.50%	2.72%	2.94%	3.16%	3.38%	3.60%	3.80%	12.52%
Enterprise Products	2.20	10.00%	8.97%	7.94%	6.91%	5.88%	4.85%	3.80%	13.85%
EOG Resources	4.00	11.00%	9.80%	8.60%	7.40%	6.20%	5.00%	3.80%	9.11%
Exxon Mobil Corp.	4.00	3.00%	3.13%	3.26%	3.39%	3.52%	3.65%	3.80%	7.40%
Hess Midstream	3.05	9.00%	8.13%	7.26%	6.39%	5.52%	4.65%	3.80%	15.16%
Kinder Morgan, Inc.	1.20	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	9.07%
Marathon Petroleum	3.70	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	6.91%
National Fuel Gas	2.04	3.00%	3.13%	3.26%	3.39%	3.52%	3.65%	3.80%	7.09%
Oneok, Inc	4.10	4.00%	3.97%	3.94%	3.91%	3.88%	3.85%	3.80%	7.97%
Ovintiv	1.32	10.00%	8.97%	7.94%	6.91%	5.88%	4.85%	3.80%	8.77%
Phillips 66	4.70	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	8.49%
Valero Energy	4.26	2.00%	2.30%	2.60%	2.90%	3.20%	3.50%	3.80%	6.92%
Western Midstream	3.55	12.50%	11.05%	9.60%	8.15%	6.70%	5.25%	3.80%	18.15%
Williams Co, Inc.	2.02	4.50%	4.38%	4.26%	4.14%	4.02%	3.90%	3.80%	7.80%
								Average:	9.70%
								Median:	8.92%
					Cost of	Equity Ca	pital - DCF	Ke Estimate:	9.70%

Data Source:

Column (1) = Value Line

Column (2) = Value Line average estimated growth rates.

Columns (3) - (7) = Linear reduction of short-term growth rate projections to sustainable level.

Column (8) = Long Term Projected GDP Growth Rate and PCE Inflation Projections from U.S. Federal Reserve.

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Support for Market Multiples

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline	Industries (SIC 4612/4	922)	
		(1)	(2)	
		Stock		P/E
Company Name	Ticker	Price	Earnings	Multiple
Cheniere Energy PTRS	CQP	55.40	4.35	12.74
Devon Energy	DVN	33.22	4.80	6.92
Enbridge, Inc.	ENB.TO	42.17	2.75	15.33
Enterprise Products	EPD	31.78	2.70	11.77
EOG Resources	EOG	121.07	11.65	10.39
Exxon Mobil Corp.	XOM	109.57	8.05	13.61
Hess Midstream	HESM	36.58	2.45	14.93
Kinder Morgan, Inc.	KMI	27.10	1.15	23.57
Marathon Petroleum	MPC	142.29	10.75	13.24
National Fuel Gas	NFG	60.93	5.01	12.16
Oneok, Inc	OKE	103.28	5.00	20.66
Ovintiv	OVV	40.41	6.10	6.62
Phillips 66	PSX	119.20	6.00	19.87
Valero Energy	VLO	126.02	8.50	14.83
Western Midstream	WES	39.26	4.00	9.82
Williams Co, Inc.	WMB	54.65	2.00	27.33
			Mean:	14.61
			Median:	13.43
		P,	/E Estimate:	15.00
			Equity Rate:	6.67%
Data Source:	har 2024 20 D	A		
(1) NASDAQ, 12-30-2024 Decem (2) Value Line Industry Summay				
12, value Line maasti y Summay	₩ 1110CX, 11-22	. 2027		

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Direct Debt Rate Calculation

Fluid/Natural Gas Pipeline Industries (SIC 4612)	/4922)	
Direct Capitalization Debt Rate		
Interest Expense (\$ mil)	\$	31,054
Total Value of Debt (TVD) (\$ mil)	\$	309,644
Current Yield = Interest Expense/TVD		10.03%
Data Source:		
Value Line Investment Survey, 11-22-2024		



road Class I Industry (SIC 4011)			1 2.5
ity:			Refer
Risk Adjusted Models			
	САРМ	10	1.74% Pag
Dividend Growth Models			
Dividend drown models	DGM or DCF Model (Dividend Growt	h) 10).25% Pag
	DGM or DCF Model (Earnings Growt	h) 10	0.50% Pag
	DGM or DCF Model (b * ROE = Grow		5.00% Pag
	Multi Stage DCF	6	i.50% Pag
	Average	10	.80%
Fatimated Cost of Family Conited		12	.43%
estimated Cost of Equity Capital ot: Estimated Cost of Debt Capital			Pag
ot:	Cost of Capital Summary		Pag
ot:	Cost of Capital Summary	5	Pag
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital	Market Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average	Pag
ıt:	Market Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average	Pag
t: Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component	Market Capital Structure Cost of Capita	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	Pag
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component Debt	Market Capital Structure Cost of Capital 20.00% 5.68%	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	Pag



ilroac						Reference
uity:						
	Risk Adjusted Models					
		CAPM			10.74%	Page 5
	Dividend Growth Models					
			lel (Dividend Growth)		10.25%	Page 7
			lel (Earnings Growth)		10.50%	Page 7
			lel (b * ROE = Growth)		16.00%	Page 7
		Multi Stage DCF			6.50%	Page 8
		Average			10.80%	
	Estimated Cost of Equity Capital				12.69%	
	1 7 7					
bt:						
bt:	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital	Cost of Coni	tal Summana		5.68%	Page 3
ebt:	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital	Cost of Capi	tal Summary		5.68%	Page 3
bt:	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component	Cost of Capi Market Capital Structure	tal Summary	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	5.68%	Page 3
bt:		Market Capital	·	Before-Tax Weighted Average	5.68%	Page 3
bt:	Capital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	5.68%	Page 3
bt:	Capital Component Debt	Market Capital Structure 20.00%	Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	5.68%	Page 3



Railroa	d Class I Industry (SIC 4011)					
		Direc	ct Rate			Reference
Equity:						
	Estimated Cost of Equity Capital				4.88%	Page 9
Debt:						
	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital				4.12%	Page 10
		Cost of Capi	tal Summary			
	Capital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	_	
	Debt	20.00%	4.12%	0.82%		
	Equity	80.00%	4.88%	3.90%	-	
	Total	100.00%	<u> </u>	4.72%	=	
			Rounded	4.75%		
					-	

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Analysis of Debt Capital

Railroad Class I Industry (SIC 4011)						
				Rat	tir	ngs
Company		Ticker		Moody's		S&P
Canadian National Railway	Ī	CNI		A2		A-
Canadian Pacific Kansas City		СР		Baa2		BBB+
CSX Corp.	Ī	CSX		A3		BBB+
Norfolk Southern Corp.	Ī	NSC		Baa1		BBB+
Union Pacific Corp.		UNP		A3		A-
		Averag	ge Rating	Α		BBB
NR = Not Rated						
RW = Rating Withdrawn						
Mergent Bond Record, January 2025	;					
Corporate		Aaa	Aa	Α		Baa
October	Ī	4.95%	5.17%	5.33%		5.63%
November		5.14%	5.33%	5.49%		5.78%
December	I	5.20%	5.37%	5.53%		5.80%
Average	Ī	5.10%	5.29%	5.45%		5.74%
			-	-		
Public Utilities		Aaa	Aa	Α		Baa
October		-	5.29%	5.41%		5.61%
November		-	5.43%	5.55%		5.75%
December		-	5.45%	5.58%		5.77%
Average		-	5.39%	5.51%		5.71%
		-	-	-		
Industrials		Aaa	Aa	Α		Baa
October		4.95%	5.05%	5.24%		5.65%
November		5.14%	5.23%	5.43%		5.80%
December		5.20%	5.28%	5.47%		5.83%
Average	T	5.10%	5.19%	5.38%		5.76%
Debt Yield Rate Estimate						5.68%
Data Sources:						
https://www.moodys.com						
https://standardandpoors.com						
Mergent Bond Record, January 2025						

		Ratings		
<u>Dispe</u>	ersions & Av	verages Num	ber of Comp	<u>panies</u>
Agency				
S&P				
AAA	1			
AA	2			
A	3	2	6	
BBB	4	3	12	
ВВ	5			
В	6			
CCC	7			
С	9			
D	10			
Total		5	18	
Average Ra	ting:			3.60
Agency				
Moody's				
Aaa	1			
Aa	2			
A	3	3	9	
Ваа	4	2	8	
Ва	5			
В	6			
Caa	7			
Ca	8			
С	9			
Total		5	17	
Average Ra	ting:			3.40

January 1, 2025

Analysis of the Market Capital Structure

Railroad Class I Industry (SIC 4011)								
		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Stock	Debt	Debt	Stock	Shares (mil)	Equity	Equity	Total Capital
Company Name	Symbol	(\$ mil)	%	Price	Outstanding	(\$ mil)	%	(\$ mil)
Canadian National Railway	CNI	15,300	18.89%	104.46	628.80	65,684	81.11%	80,984
Canadian Pacific Kansas City	СР	16,199	18.97%	74.13	933.34	69,189	81.03%	85,388
CSX Corp.	CSX	18,541	22.36%	33.38	1,928.42	64,371	77.64%	82,912
Norfolk Southern Corp.	NSC	17,199	23.52%	247.24	226.24	55,936	76.48%	73,135
Union Pacific Corp.	UNP	31,413	18.28%	231.61	606.26	140,416	81.72%	171,829
Mean:		19,730	20.40%			79,119.20	79.60%	98,850
Median:		17,199	18.97%			65,684.00	81.03%	82,912
Market Capital Structure Estimate:		Debt:	20.00%			Equity:	80.00%	

Data Source:

Columns (1) & (4), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 11-15-2024

Column (2) = Column (1) / Column (7)

Column (3), NASDAQ, 12-30-2024

Column (5) = Column (3) * Column (4)

Column (7) = Column (1) + Column (5)

January 1, 2025 Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM)

CAPM ==> $K_e = R_f + \beta$ (ERP)

Railroad Class I Industry (SIC 4011)	
Risk-Free Rate	4.58%
Beta (β)	1.00
Equity Risk Premium (ERP): (R _m - R _f)*	6.16%
Adjusted Equity Risk Premium: (β * ERP)	6.16%
Cost of Equity Capital - CAPM	10.74%
U.S. Department of the Treasury, Daily Treasury Yield Curve Rates, Selected Yields	
U.S. Treasury Securities:	
2024 December - 30 Day	4.58%
2024 November - 60 Day	4.56%
2024 October - 90 Day	4.49%
Risk-Free Rate of Return R _f , 30-year Treasury Rate. 2024 December - 30 Day Average.	4.58%
* Equity Risk Premium = Average of 7.31% (historical) and 5.00% (Kroll's Recommended)	

January 1, 2025 Beta (β) Analysis

ol	"β" 0.90 0.95 1.00 1.05
	0.95 1.00
	1.00
	1.05
,	
	1.00
Mean:	0.98
Median:	1.00
eta (β) Estimate:	1.00

January 1, 2025

Dividend Growth Model (DGM or DCF)

D₁ where $P_0 = P_0 =$

Railroad Class I Industry (SIC 4	011)											
		(1)	(2)		(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)				
Company Name	Stock Symbol	Stock Price P ₀	Expected Dividend D ₁	Dividend Yield (D ₁ / P ₀)	Dividend Growth g	Earnings Growth g	b	ROE	g=(b * ROE)	(Dividends) K _e	(Earnings) K _e	g=(b * ROE) K _e
Canadian National Railway	CNI	104.46	2.68	2.57%	8.50%	7.00%	54.00%	23.00%	12.42%	11.07%	9.57%	14.99%
Canadian Pacific Kansas City	СР	74.13	0.64	0.86%	9.00%	8.00%	82.00%	9.00%	7.38%	9.86%	8.86%	8.24%
CSX Corp.	CSX	33.38	0.52	1.56%	12.50%	9.00%	74.00%	27.00%	19.98%	14.06%	10.56%	21.54%
Norfolk Southern Corp.	NSC	247.24	5.60	2.27%	5.00%	11.50%	53.00%	17.50%	9.28%	7.27%	13.77%	11.55%
Union Pacific Corp.	UNP	231.61	5.48	2.37%	6.00%	8.00%	52.00%	41.00%	21.32%	8.37%	10.37%	23.69%
			Mean:	1.93%	8.20%	8.70%	63.00%	23.50%	14.08%	10.13%	10.63%	16.00%
			Median:	2.27%	8.50%	8.00%	54.00%	23.00%	12.42%	9.86%	10.37%	14.99%
							Cos	t of Equity Capital -	DCF K _e Estimate:	10.25%	10.50%	16.00%

Notes:

b = (1 - payout ratio) = Retention Ratio

ROE = Return on Book Equity

Not Meaningful (NMF)

Data Source:

Column (1), NASDAQ, December Closing Average

Columns (2) - (6), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 11-15-2024

January 1, 2025

Multiple-Stage Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) Estimated Cost of Common Equity

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
	Annualized Quarterly	Growth Years	Growth Year	Growth Year	Growth Year	Growth Year	Growth Year	Growth in Perpetuity	Cost of Equity
Company Name	Dividend	1-5	6	7	8	9	10		
Canadian National Railway	\$2.60	8.50%	7.72%	6.94%	6.16%	5.38%	4.60%	3.80%	7.29%
Canadian Pacific Railway	\$0.64	9.00%	8.13%	7.26%	6.39%	5.52%	4.65%	3.80%	4.93%
CSX Corp.	\$0.52	12.50%	11.05%	9.60%	8.15%	6.70%	5.25%	3.80%	6.62%
Norfolk Southern Corp.	\$5.60	5.00%	4.80%	4.60%	4.40%	4.20%	4.00%	3.80%	6.33%
Union Pacific Corp.	\$5.48	6.00%	5.63%	5.26%	4.89%	4.52%	4.15%	3.80%	6.62%
								Average:	6.36%
								Median:	6.62%
					Cos	st of Equity	y Capital -	DCF Estimates:	6.50%

Data Source:

Column (1) = Value Line

Column (2) = Value Line Average Estimated Growth Rates

Columns (3) - (7) = Linear Reduction of Short-term Growth Rate Projections to Sustainable Level

Column (8) = Long Term Projected GDP Growth Rate Projections from U.S. Federal Reserve

Support for Market Multiples

Railroad Class I Industry (SIC 401	L 1)			
		(1)	(2)	
		Stock		P/E
Company Name	Ticker	Price	Earnings	Multiple
Canadian National Railway	CNI	104.46	5.50	18.99
Canadian Pacific Kansas City	СР	74.13	3.25	22.81
CSX Corp.	CSX	33.38	1.85	18.04
Norfolk Southern Corp.	NSC	247.24	11.50	21.50
Union Pacific Corp.	UNP	231.61	11.00	21.06
			Mean	20.48
			Median	21.06
		P	/E Estimate	20.50
			Equity Rate	4.88%
Data Source: Column (1) NASDAQ, December Closing	Average			
Coulmn (2) Value Line Industry Summay	_	15-2024		

January 1, 2025 Direct Debt Rate Calculation

Railroad Class I (SIC 4011)	
Direct Capitalization Debt Rate	
Interest Expense (\$ mil)	\$ 3,808
Total Value of Debt (TVD) (\$ mil)	\$ 92,533
Current Yield = Interest Expense/TVD	4.12%
Data Source:	
Value Line Investment Survey, 11-15-2024	



Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Staff Recommendation

					Reference
ty:					nererene
Risk Adjusted Models					
	CAPM			9.82%	Page 5
Dividend Growth Models					
	DGM or DCF Mode	l (Dividend Growth)		11.80%	Page 7
	DGM or DCF Mode			12.30%	Page 7
		I (b * ROE = Growth)		12.00%	Page 7
- <u></u>	Multi Stage DCF			8.50%	Page 8
	Average			10.88%	
Estimated Cost of Equity Capital				15.03%	
: Fetimated Cost of Debt Canital				6 50%	Page 3
: Estimated Cost of Debt Capital				6.50%	Page 3
	Cost of Capit	al Summary		6.50%	Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital	Cost of Capit Market Capital Structure		Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital	6.50%	Page 3
	Market Capital	Cost of Capital	Weighted	6.50%	Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital	6.50%	Page 3
Estimated Cost of Debt Capital Capital Component Debt	Market Capital Structure 50.00%	Cost of Capital	Weighted Average Cost of Capital 3.25%	6.50%	Page 3



Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Staff Recommendation

	nmunications Industry (SIC 4813)					Reference			
	Direct Rate								
quity:									
	Estimated Cost of Equity Capital				9.09%	Page 9			
Debt:									
	Estimated Cost of Debt Capital				4.73%	Page 10			
		Cost of Capital Sui	mmary						
	Capital Component	Market Capital Structure	Cost of Capital	Before-Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital					
	Debt	50.00%	4.73%	2.37%					
	Equity	50.00%	9.09%	4.55%					
	Total	100.00%	<u> </u>	6.92%					
			Rounded	6.85%					

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Analysis of Debt Capital

Telecommunications Industry (SIC: 4813	3)				
				ı	Ratings
Company		Ticker		Moody's	S&P
AT&T		Т		Baa2	BBB
Cable One		CABO		Ba3	BB
Comcast Corporation		CMCSA		A3	A-
Deutsche Telekom		DTEGY		Baa1	BBB+
Lumen Technologies		LUMN		Caa1	CCC+
Shenandoah Telecommunications		SHEN		NPS	AA
Verizon Communications		VZ		Baa1	BBB+
		Av	erage Rating	Baa	BBB
NR = Not Rated					
RW = Rating Withdrawn					
Mergent Bond Record, January 2025					
Corporate		Aaa	Aa	Α	Baa
October		4.95%	5.17%	5.33%	5.63%
November		5.14%	5.33%	5.49%	5.78%
December		5.20%	5.37%	5.53%	5.80%
Average		5.10%	5.29%	5.45%	5.74%
Public Utilities		Aaa	Aa	Α	Ваа
October		-	5.29%	5.41%	5.61%
November		-	5.43%	5.55%	5.75%
December		=	5.45%	5.58%	5.77%
Average		-	5.39%	5.51%	5.71%
					_
Industrials		Aaa	Aa	A	Baa
October		4.95%	5.05%	5.24%	5.65%
November		5.14%	5.23%	5.43%	5.80%
December		5.20%	5.28%	5.47%	5.83%
Average		5.10%	5.19%	5.38%	5.76%
Debt Yield Rate Estimate	6.50%				
Data Source:					
https://www.moodys.com					
https://standardandpoors.com					
Mergent Bond Record, January 2025					

		Ratings		
Disp	ersions & A	verages Numb	er of Compa	inies
Agency				
S&P				
AAA	1			
AA	2	1		
Α	3	1	3	
BBB	4	2	8	
BB	5	1	5	
В	6			
CC	8	1	8	
С	9			
D	10			
Total		6	24	
Average Rat	ing:			4.00
Agency				
Moody's				
Aaa	1			
	1 2			
Aaa		1	3	
Aaa Aa	2	1 2	3	
Aaa Aa A	2			
Aaa Aa A Baa	2 3 4	2	8	
Aaa Aa A Baa Ba Ba	2 3 4 5	2	8	
Aaa Aa A Baa Ba Ba Caa	2 3 4 5 6	1	8	
Aaa Aa A Baa Ba Ba	2 3 4 5 6 7	1	8	
Aaa Aa A Baa Ba Ba Caa	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	1	8	
Aaa Aa Aa Aa Baa Ba Ba Caa Ca	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	1	8 5 7	4.60

January 1, 2025

Analysis of the Market Capital Structure

elecommunications Industry (SIC 4813)									
		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	
	Ticker	Debt	Debt	Stock	Shares (mil)	Equity	Equity	Total Capital	
Company Name	Symbol	(\$ mil)	%	Price	Outstanding	(\$ mil)	%	(\$ mil)	
AT&T	Т	129,012	43.75%	23.12	7,175	165,886	56.25%	294,898	
Cable One	CABO	3,488	61.91%	382.48	5.61	2,146	38.09%	5,634	
Comcast Corporation	CMCSA	101,364	40.07%	39.61	3,827	151,588	59.93%	252,952	
Deutsche Telekom	DTEGY	120,200	44.05%	30.99	4,927	152,688	55.95%	272,888	
Lumen Technologies	LUMN	18,554	74.80%	6.16	1,015	6,252	25.20%	24,806	
Shenandoah Telecommunications	SHEN	344.50	32.20%	13.18	55	725	67.76%	1,070	
	74,801	49.46%			93,302	50.53%	168,103		
	101,364	43.90%			151,588	56.10%	252,952		
Market Capital Struct	Debt:	50.00%			Equity:	50.00%			

Data Source:

Columns (1) & (4), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 12-06-2024

Column (2) = Column (1) / Column (7)

Column (3), NASDAQ, 12-30-2024

Column (5) = Column (3) * Column (4)

Column (7) = Column (1) + Column (5)

January 1, 2025 Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM)

CAPM ==> $K_e = R_f + (\beta * ERP)$

Telecommunications Industry (SIC 4813)				
Risk-Free Rate (R _f)	4.58%			
Beta (β)	0.85			
Equity Risk Premium (ERP): $(R_m - R_f)$	6.16%			
Adjusted Equity Risk Premium: (β * ERP)	5.24%			
Cost of Equity Capital - CAPM	9.82%			
U.S. Department of the Treasury, Daily Treasury Yield Curve Rates, Selected Yields				
U.S. Treasury Securities:				
2024 December - 30 Day	4.58%			
2024 November - 60 Day	4.56%			
2024 October - 90 Day	4.49%			
Risk-Free Rate of Return R _f , 30-year Treasury Rate. 2024 December - 30 Day Average.				
* Equity Risk Premium = Average of 7.31% (historical) and 5.00% (Kroll's Recommended)	•			

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Beta (β) Analysis

	Symbol T CABO	"β" 0.80
Cable One	T CABO	
Cable One Comcast Corporation	CABO	4.00
Comcast Corporation		1.00
	CMCSA	0.85
Deutsche Telekom	DTEGY	0.85
Lumen Technologies	LUMN	1.15
Shenandoah Telecommunications	SHEN	0.85
	Mean:	0.94
	Median:	0.85
	Beta (β) Estimate:	0.85

January 1, 2025

Dividend Growth Model (DGM or DCF)

D₁ where $P_0 = P_0 =$

Telecommunications Industry (SIC 4813)													
		(1)	(2)			(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)				
	Ticker	Stock Price	Expected Dividend	Dividend Yield		Dividend Growth	EPS Growth		205	// * DOS)	(Dividends)	(Earnings)	g=(b * ROE)
Company Name	Symbol	P ₀	D ₁	(D_1/P_0)		g	g	b	ROE	g=(b * ROE)	r _e	K _e	K _e
AT&T	Т	23.12	1.11	4.80%		-3.50%	4.00%	55.00%	14.50%	7.98%	NMF	8.80%	12.78%
Cable One	CABO	382.48	12.50	3.27%		2.50%	1.00%	66.00%	10.50%	6.93%	5.77%	4.27%	10.20%
Comcast Corporation	CMCSA	39.61	1.31	3.31%		8.50%	9.00%	71.00%	20.00%	14.20%	11.81%	12.31%	17.51%
Deutsche Telekom	DTEGY	30.99	0.85	2.74%		12.50%	15.50%	56.00%	15.00%	8.40%	15.24%	18.24%	11.14%
Lumen Technologies	LUMN	6.16	NMF	NMF		NMF	-8.50%	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF
Shenandoah Telecommunications	SHEN	13.18	0.11	0.83%		12.00%	39.00%	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	39.83%	NMF
	Mean: 0.96% 6.40% 10.00%								15.80%	9.06%	10.94%	16.69%	12.91%
Median: 3.27% 8.50% 6.50%							6.50%	56.00%	15.00%	7.98%	11.81%	12.31%	11.96%
Cost of Equity Capital - DCF K _e Estima										DCF K _e Estimate:	11.80%	12.30%	12.00%

Notes:

b = (1 - payout ratio) = Retention Ratio ROE = Return on Book Equity

Not Meaningful (NMF)

<u>Data Source:</u> Column (1), NASDAQ, 12-30-2024

Columns (2) - (6), Value Line Industry Summary & Index, 12-06-2024

January 1, 2025

Multiple-Stage Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) Estimated Costs of Common Equity

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	
	Expected									
	Annualized	Growth	Cost							
	Quarterly	Years	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	in Perpetuity	of Equity	
Company Name	Dividend	1-5	6	7	8	9	10			
AT&T	1.11	-3.50%	-2.28%	-1.06%	0.16%	1.38%	2.60%	3.80%	NMF	
Cable One	12.5	2.50%	2.72%	2.94%	3.16%	3.38%	3.60%	3.80%	6.91%	
Comcast Corporation	1.31	8.50%	7.72%	6.94%	6.16%	5.38%	4.60%	3.80%	8.39%	
Deutsche Telekom	0.85	12.50%	11.05%	9.60%	8.15%	6.70%	5.25%	3.80%	8.68%	
Lumen Technologies	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	3.80%	NMF	
Shenandoah Telecommunications	0.11	12.00%	10.63%	9.26%	7.89%	6.52%	5.15%	3.80%	NMF	
								Mean:	7.99%	
N									8.39%	
Cost of Equity Capital - DCF Ke Estimate:										

Data Source:

Column (1) = Value Line

Column (2) = Value Line average estimated growth rates.

Columns (3) - (7) = Linear reduction of short-term growth rate projections to sustainable level.

Column (8) = Long Term Projected GDP Growth Rate Projections from U.S. Federal Reserve.

Cost of Capital Study January 1, 2025 Market Multiples

Telecommunications Industry (SIC 4813)				
		(1)	(2)	
Company Name	Ticker	Stock Price	EPS	P/E Multiple
AT&T	Т	23.12	2.25	10.28
Cable One	CABO	382.48	35.10	10.90
Comcast Corporation	CMCSA	39.61	4.25	9.32
Deutsche Telekom	DTEGY	30.99	1.85	16.75
Lumen Technologies	LUMN	6.16	0.20	30.80
Shenandoah Telecommunications	SHEN	13.18	0.35	37.66
			Mean:	19.29
		N	/ledian:	13.83
		P/E Es	timate:	11.00
		Equit	y Rate:	9.09%
<u>Data Source:</u> Column (1) NASDAQ, 12-30-2024 Coulmn (2) Value Line Industry Summay & Index, 12-06-2024				

Direct Debt Rate Calculation

Telecommunications Industry (SIC 4813)	
Direct Capitalization Debt Rate	
Interest Expense (\$ mil)	\$ 22,852
Total Value of Debt (TVD) (\$ mil)	\$ 483,354
Current Yield = Interest Expense/TVD	4.73%
<u>Data Source:</u> Value Line Investment Survey, 12-06-2024	